

## Accessibility Approach to Tourism: A Case of Anjungan TMII

Ika Triana<sup>1</sup>, Nurul Sukma Lestari<sup>2</sup>, and Rachel Dyah Wiastuti<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Binus Business School, Bina Nusantara University

<sup>2</sup>Business Hotel Management Department, Bina Nusantara University

<sup>3</sup>Hotel Management Department, Bina Nusantara University

itriana@binus.edu\*, nurul.lestari@binus.edu, and rwiastuti@binus.edu

**Abstract:** Anjungan at Taman Mini Indonesia Indah is made to provide information about various tribes' traditional houses in Indonesia. The aim of this study is to determine the Anjungan accessibility based on UNWTO Accessible Tourism concept as a part of sustainable tourism. Data were gathered from direct field observation and interview on March to April 2019. In Anjungan, there are thirty-three replica of provinces in Indonesia. The findings refine the Anjungan accessibility based on seven categories; parking area, communication, signage, horizontal movement, vertical movement, public hygiene facilities, and pricing. The results show good compliance with pricing there is no increase in fees for visitors with special requirements. However, a vertical movement is almost not implemented and is limited access to public toilets and defects available. Therefore, this study contributes to information services so that everyone can visit the Anjungan at TMII to be able to learn about the history and culture of each province.

**Keywords:** Accessibility; Accessible; Accessible Tourism; Sustainable Tourism; Anjungan; TMII

### 1. Introduction

Taman Mini Indonesia Indah is one of the biggest amusement parks in Indonesia, with the total area around 150 ha (Wardijono, Wardhani, Chandra, & Pamungkas, 2018). Taman Mini Indonesia Indah or known as TMII was built in 1972 and officially opened on 20th April 1975, which the first idea came from Ibu Tien Soeharto (TMII Pesona Indonesia, 2016). In the beginning, the park only had "Anjungan Daerah", that was the replica from twenty-six provinces in Indonesia, and now it has thirty-three provinces. Anjungan Daerah was made to provide information about various tribes' traditional houses in Indonesia, including historical objects, traditional clothes, art equipment and handicrafts (Triastuti & Rakhmani, 2011). Anjungan TMII can be defined as a theme park. Based on Ho & Ap, a theme park is a building, attraction or landscape that has a specific theme by combining entertainment, food, souvenir shops and the environment that suits the theme (Ho & Ap, 2009).

A theme park is an improvement of the amusement park (Richard, Kaak, & Orlowski, 2017). A theme park is one of the tourist attractions, which is managed to meet the needs of visitors such as fun, recreation, leisure and education (Raluca & Gina, 2008). As (Calvo-Mora, Navarro-García, & Periañez-Cristóbal, 2015) one of a tourist attraction, Anjungan TMII must fulfill the basic requirement for tourism that is tourism for all. Where tourism is a social product that must be enjoyed by all people regardless of their individual, social and economic level (Calvo-Mora, Navarro-García, & Periañez-Cristóbal, 2015). Based on estimation from the World Health Organization said that 15% of the global population, roughly 1 billion people, live with some form of disability (World Tourism Organization, 2016). People with disabilities include temporary disabilities such as injuries, pregnant women, people with baby strollers, tourists with luggage and elderly people must still be able to enjoy the same conditions as normal people (Prescott, 2015).

Due to the increasing number of people with special needs, accessible tourism has become one of the most popular tourism concepts (Wee & Sanmargaraja, 2015). People with special needs/disabilities often feel disappointed when they come to a tourist destination because they cannot experience the same value with normal people, because the place has not to implement accessible

tourism yet ( Ambrose, 2012). Information regarding accessibility is a basic requirement for tourists with disability (Mulyaningrum, Lestari, & Wiastuti, 2018).

The tourist experience has become a focus of the tourism industry because it can determine whether the tourist will come back or not ( Lin & Kuo, 2016). If the tourism industry can minimize or control the aspect of accessible tourism, it is not impossible for tourism to established sustainable tourism, because tourism is very beneficial for various parties involved (UNEP, 2005). The accessibility needs to be improved in the maximum way to sustain in the tourism business (Mulyaningrum, Lestari, & Wiastuti, 2018).

The purpose of this study is to know how far has Anjungan TMII implemented accessible tourism in each area of thirty-three provinces.

## 2. Literature Review

### 2.1 Tourism for All

Tourism for all is a public necessity that is also very profitable for business (Pacific Asia Travel Association, 2015). All industries and businesses engaged in tourism must have the same goal, that is to create tourism universally accessible and without any obstacles (European Commission). Accessibility, sustainability and equality are known as tourism for all (UNWTO, 2016). That is, ensuring that persons with disabilities have access, on an equal basis with others, to the physical environment, transportation, information, communication and public facilities (UNWTO, 2016).

### 2.2 People with Disability

A person who has long term physical, mental, intellectual or sensory impairment can be categorized as people with disabilities (World Tourism Organization, 2013). People with disabilities have various needs, capability, and contribution to their societies (UNHCR, 2017)

### 2.3 Accessible Tourism

Accessibility covers many things besides the environment with no barrier but also related to accessibility on the internet site, signage, the way of communication, transportation and a staff who have knowledge about disability in the tourism industry (Wee & Sanmargaraja, 2015). The general purpose of accessible tourism is to provide access to all tourism product and services, whatever the situation or condition in all tourist destinations (Zsarnoczky, 2017). Beside of offering barrier-free access for disabilities people, accessible tourism also provides universal design condition that can help people with disabilities temporary or permanent, people with a baby stroller, elder people and create a secure situation for the employee to works (World Tourism Organization, 2013)

UNWTO has general requirements for tourism facilities and sites, should comply with (World Tourism Organization, 2013):

- a. **Parking area;** a special space must provide for person with disabilities, near with the entrance, should be a proper signage, and must be monitored to prevent the space wont used by non-disabled people.
- b. **Communication;** the use of sign language, braille, and various methods used to communicate by persons with disabilities must be provided and facilitated.
- c. **Signage;** the information, ticket counter should have an accessible area reserved for use by person with disabilities, located near with entrance. Announcement should be both visual and audible. Services and facilities should be used universal symbol.
- d. **Horizontal Movement;** all the corridor and passageways must be free of barrier, wide enough to permit two wheelchairs side by side, otherwise provide passing points.
- e. **Vertical Movement;**
  - **Elevators** should have a plenty number of elevators wide enough for a person using a wheelchair to enter and move easily. Specially designed and equipped for easy use by such persons and for the vision impairment, should be equipped with emergency systems accessible to the hearing impaired.
  - **Stairs and ramps,** whenever possible, the built at the same level or equipped with ramps where there is a change in floor levels.

- f. **Public Hygiene Facilities;** accessible toilet and washbasin must locate at the same place with normal toilet. Accessible toilets must be adjusted for the area of the room and equipment must also be adjusted to the needs. Must be provide a system that allow persons inside the toilet stalls to find and use emergency lighting signs and switches.
- g. **Prices;** the price shall not give rise to an increase in rates for customers with disabilities.

## 2.4 Sustainable Tourism

Sustainable tourism is a tourism that takes full account of the present and the future of economic, social and environmental impacts, addressing the needs of visitors, industry, people environment and host community (UNEP, 2005). Sustainable tourism as a protection and tourism resource that can be used for the future and the availability of resources for present and future generations (Junaid, 2015).

As a leading to management of all resources in such a way that economic, social and aesthetic needs can be fulfilled while maintaining cultural integrity, essential ecological processes, biological diversity and life support systems (A Simple User's Guide to Certification for Sustainable Tourism and Ecotourism). Sustainable tourism impacts on increasing regional income, creates economic development for the local environment and opens many employment opportunities for the local community (Halter & Randle, 2012).

## 3. Methodology

This paper was gathered from a qualitative descriptive research. The complete summarization of specific events in daily terms that experienced by individual or group can be said as qualitative descriptive research (V. Lambert & Lambert, 2012). The objects of this research were Anjungan Daerah that was referred in the official website of Taman Mini Indonesia Indah, [http://www.tamanmini.com/pesona\\_indonesia/](http://www.tamanmini.com/pesona_indonesia/). There are thirty-three Anjungan Daerah in Indonesia, that refers to the number of provinces in Indonesia.

The primary data was collected from field research through interview and observation, conducted within two months from March to April 2019. A secondary data was gathered from the library, journal, documentation, UNWTO report, a photograph of the actual condition, and collected brochure from each Anjungan.

Every observation took five to six hours of field research. Where the researcher uses a checklist for guideline. The content of the checklist consisted of parking area, communication, signage, horizontal movement, vertical movement, public hygiene facilities, and price.

### 3.1. Table and Figure

No.	Nama Anjungan	Abb	No.	Nama Anjungan	Abb
1	Pemerintah Aceh	AC	18	Nusa Tenggara Barat	NB
2	Sumatera Utara	SU	19	Nusa Tenggara Timur	NT
3	Kepulauan Riau	KR	20	Kalimantan Selatan	KS
4	Riau	RI	21	Kalimantan Tengah	KT
5	Sumatera Barat	SB	22	Kalimantan Barat	KB
6	Jambi	JI	23	Kalimantan Timur	KR
7	Bangka Belitung	BB	24	Sulawesi Selatan	SS
8	Sumatera Selatan	SS	25	Sulawesi Tenggara	ST
9	Bengkulu	BU	26	Sulawesi Tengah	SH
10	Lampung	LG	27	Sulawesi Barat	SB
11	Banten	BN	28	Gorontalo	GO
12	DKI Jakarta	DJ	29	Sulawesi Utara	SU
13	Jawa Barat	JB	30	Maluku	MU
14	Jawa Tengah	JT	31	Maluku Utara	MA
15	D.I Yogyakarta	DY	32	Papua	PA
16	Jawa Timur	JT	33	Papua Barat	PB
17	Bali	BI			

## **4. Results and Discussion**

### **4.1. Result**

#### **4.1.1 Parking Area**

There are thirty-three Anjungan in TMII and almost all the Anjungan had parking area for both cars and motorcycles. For example, parking area that was in the Anjungan Aceh, Bangka Belitung, Gorontalo, Sumatera Barat, Bengkulu, Jambi which provide a large enough parking area for visitors. Anjungan Kepulauan Riau was located next to Anjungan Bangka Belitung, Banten and Papua Barat in an area where there was no barrier for each of the Anjungan, including for the parking area. So, the visitors can park their vehicles and can directly visit all four Anjungan without leaving the area like other Anjungan.

In terms of security there were no staff on duty to manage the parking area and also there were no surveillance cameras, so the visitors must take care of their luggage. In addition, the parking area provided on some Anjungan was not too large, so visitors who use the bus should park it in the parking area provided by Taman Mini Indonesia Indah, or in the roadside parking.

Taman Mini Indonesia Indah provides bicycle rental and there are tour bus facilities. For tour buses, visitors should pay Rp 10,000 for two trips. So, visitors who use private vehicles or buses can park their vehicles in the public parking area of TMII and can use bicycles or tour bus to surround all the Anjungan in TMII. In addition, there was a motorbike rental although it looked like it was not a facility provided by TMII.

On every Anjungan in TMII, there was no parking area for disabled visitors. So, if there are visitors who use wheelchairs for example, it was very difficult for them to park their vehicles, because in addition to its location that was not too close to the entrance, the parking area was not broad and inadequate parking conditions, such as rocky conditions or grassy.

#### **4.1.2 Communication**

When entering the Anjungan area, visitors were presented with an extensive map of Indonesia and / or a map of the area of each Anjungan. Then when you enter the room that displays a replica of an art instrument, custom home, traditional clothes, etc, there was a reception desk that provided pamphlets or information sheets about the area as additional information for visitors. In addition, there were officers who were also ready to help visitors to ask further questions about the Anjungan.

However, before entering Anjungan or traditional house in the Anjungan area, visitors were required to remove footwear in accordance with the instructions. Each Anjungan had information such as removing footwear before entering a room written in two languages, namely Indonesian and English, and there were also those who use the local language of the area, such as the Anjungan Bali and the Anjungan Jawa Barat. For example, at the Anjungan Bali there were various kinds of traditional Balinese houses and there was a signboard to name the traditional house which was not only in Indonesian but also use Balinese script.

At the Anjungan Jawa Barat the visitors were greeted with a sign that read "Wilujeng Sumping" which means "Welcome" at the main gate. But indeed, most of the information that exists was related to traditional clothes, traditional art tools, and the names of existing rooms using Indonesian and English.

Unfortunately no braille information was provided so that visitors who had limitations in viewing cannot get an information about that Anjungan.

#### **4.1.3 Signage**

In all Anjungan there was no ticket counter for ticket sales because visitors could enter the Anjungan area for free. However, when entering the room on the Anjungan there was one table and officer such as a receptionist who overseen welcoming guests, recording a list of visits, and provided information for visitors.

Sign direction such as the direction of toilets, musholla, motorbike parking, eating places were provided in the form of writing in Indonesian not in pictograms (universal design).

Information related to signs for visitors with disabilities was also not provided by TMII, for example such as special parking signs for people with disabilities. In this case, usually people with

disabilities who could still drive their own vehicles and used wheelchairs needed to be provided a wider parking area to facilitate accessibility to get into and out of their vehicles.

In every Anjungan there was not equipped with audio announcement only with visual, where some of the visual announcement was written in Bahasa.

#### **4.1.4 Horizontal Movement**

The front yard of each Anjungan was wide enough for some visitors who used wheelchairs. Although in some Anjungan the situation was not very accommodating to visitors with a wheelchair or carrying a baby stroller, because the Anjungan's front yard was in the form of a cement field and has holes in them.

For the inside of the Anjungan, most of it consists of rooms that were quite spacious and free from obstacles. But unfortunately, visitors with disabilities still couldn't enter most of the traditional houses on the Anjungan because most traditional houses on Anjungan are stilt houses that had to use stairs to enter the area.

#### **4.1.5 Vertical Movement**

Most of the Anjungan only had wooden stairs, and even then, many had started to be brittle, making it difficult for visitors with disabilities. In the Anjungan Jawa Timur, Sumatera Utara and Jambi provided a ramp at the front door so that it would be easier for visitors with a wheelchair or bring a baby stroller to enter the courtyard area on the Anjungan. But once again visitors with disabilities still couldn't look at the inside of the traditional house because there was only wooden stair access. Whereas for the Anjungan Jawa Timur it had more access, especially for visitors with disabilities to be able to enjoy the area because it provided a ramp so that it was easy for visitors who use wheelchairs. Anjungan Jawa Timur had the traditional houses on one level only.

#### **4.1.6 Public Hygiene Facilities**

Each Anjungan provides toilets and hand washing places. But there was no toilet for visitors with disabilities. The toilets cubicles were very small, dark, and many still provided squat toilets. The placement of the toilet location was difficult to reach, especially for visitors with disabilities. In terms of location the placement of the toilet was located at the back of each Anjungan, where the road to reach it was very difficult to pass by wheelchairs or visitors carrying a baby stroller. Because at the end of the road that leads to the toilet there were steps and a narrow distance so that it would be very difficult for the wheelchair to maneuver.

#### **4.1.7 Prices**

There was no difference in price for ordinary visitors and those with disabilities to entering the free ticket price Anjungan. Visitors were only charged a ticket when they enter TMII.

### **4.2. Discussion**

Due to common requirements for accessibility for parking areas, the Anjungan in TMII had not met accessibility requirements because there were still Anjungan that did not provide parking spaces so that visitors park their vehicles outside the Anjungan area. In addition, there was no specific area for disability. The parking area was not wide enough. It could only accommodate about 6-7 cars, but if the area of the motorbike could accommodate about more than 10 motorbikes. However, not all Anjungan had special motorized parking spaces. For example, on the Anjungan Sumatera, a motorbike parking area was placed under a traditional house in the form of a stilt house. Not only in terms of facilities, but in each Anjungan, there was no staff working in the parking area and the unavailability of CCTV surveillance cameras.

Due to common requirements of accessibility for communication, the Anjungan in TMII had fulfilled the requirements because information was provided starting from the notification of opening or closing the Anjungan to information regarding the notification of items on the Anjungan and provided in Indonesian and English. However, visitors who lack vision were not helped because the information available was not provided in Braille.

Due to common requirements of the accessibility for signing, only some of them provided pictograms, and most were only provided in Indonesian such as the Musholla, Parking, Souvenirs, and eating places. Just the sign into the restroom was provided in English, which was "toilet". And there was no audio announcement in every Anjungan

Due to common requirements of accessibility for horizontal movement, there were only three Anjungan that provided a ramp from the gate to the Anjungan. But for the Anjungan Jawa Timur there was a ramp around the area. For other Anjungan there were too many steps and stairs, making it difficult for visitors to use wheelchairs or other visitors with disabilities.

Due to the common requirements of the accessibility for vertical movement, all Anjungan at TMII did not provide elevators or escalators for visitors. All of them used ladders and for Anjungan that have traditional houses such as houses on poles, it was also quite difficult not only for visitors who had disabilities but also ordinary visitors because the stairs were almost all rather steep, and some were already brittle, such as on the Anjungan Kalimantan Barat.

Due to common requirements for accessibility for public hygiene facilities, Anjungan in TMII provided toilets. The toilet was quite clean, it's just that the location was rather cornered, and the place was too small and dark. Also provided a place for hand washing which was placed adjacent to the toilet.

Due to common requirements of accessibility for prices, the Anjungan did not rate entry tickets, so visitors could visit the Anjungan several times they wish. The ticket price was only charged when entering the TMII region and the price charged to people and vehicles. And there was no additional charge for dissability visitor.

## 5. Conclusion

Thirty-three regional Anjungan in TMII implemented accessibility requirements partially based on accessibility tourism standards. There were still things that needed to be improved from the seven accessibility tourism categories; parking area, communication, signage, horizontal movement, vertical movement, public hygiene facilities and prices. From the seven categories, which still needed to be improved were the parking area, horizontal movement and vertical movement. As for communication, signage and prices were considered as implemented. However, there were some accessible standards. The must be improved was the availability of information in braille and audio announcement. In conclusion, to encourage Anjungan tourism sustainability, Anjungan are required to support its accessibility standards by providing the Anjungan that can be accessed by everyone. The more Anjungan that could be accessible by everyone, the more visitors are willing to come and revisit the intention. And to be aware of that, TMII needed to provide Anjungan facilities that could be accessed by everyone and improved the quality of staff so that they could help visitors to enjoy their visits throughout the Anjungan.

**Acknowledgement.** This research is fully supported by Binus Research Grant.

## References

- Ambrose, I. (2012). *Best Practice in Accessible Tourism: Inclusion, Disability, Ageing Population and Tourism*. (D. Buhalis, S. Darcy, & I. Ambrose, Eds.) London: Channel View Publications.
- Lin, C.-H., & Kuo, B.-L. (2016). The Behavioral Consequences of Tourist Experience. *Tourism Management Perspectives*, 18, pg.84-91.
- Raluca, D. C., & Gina, S. (2008). Theme Park - The Main Concept of Tourism Industry Development. *Annals of the University of Oradea, Economic Science Series*, 17(2), pg.641.
- Wee, S., & Sanmargaraja, S. (2015). Barriers of Accessible Tourism in the National Parks in Malaysia: Case Study in Tanjung Piai National Park. *Australian Journal of Basic and Applied Sciences*, 9(31), 452-458.
- Calvo-Mora, A., Navarro-García, A., & Periañez-Cristóbal, R. (2015). Tourism for All and Performance: An Analysis of Accessibility Management in Hotels. In M. Peris-Ortiz, J. Álvarez-García, & C. Rueda-Armengot, *Achieving Competitive Advantage through Quality Management* (pp. pp 111-132). Switzerland: Springer, Cham.
- European Commission*. (n.d.). Retrieved May 6, 2019, from [https://ec.europa.eu/growth/sectors/tourism/business-portal/accessibility\\_en](https://ec.europa.eu/growth/sectors/tourism/business-portal/accessibility_en)

- Government of Western Australia.* (2015, October 15). Retrieved from <http://www.disability.wa.gov.au/understanding-disability1/understanding-disability/what-is-disability/>
- Halter, R., & Randle, D. (2012, April 27). *Sustainable Tourism: A Key to Global Solutions*. Retrieved April 6, 2019, from Huffpost: [https://www.huffpost.com/entry/sustainable-tourism-a-key\\_b\\_1301966](https://www.huffpost.com/entry/sustainable-tourism-a-key_b_1301966)
- Ho, P., & Ap, J. (2009). *Tourism and hospitality studies: Theme parks and attractions*. Hongkong: Education Bureau.
- Junaid, I. (2015). Sustainable Tourism in Toraja: Persepective of Indigenous People. *ASEAN Journal on Hospitality and Tourism*, 14(1), 45 - 55.
- Mulyaningrum, N. I., Lestari, N. S., & Wiastuti, R. D. (2018). ACCESSIBILITY DEVELOPMENT: A GUIDE TO SUSTAIN MODERN MARKET FOR URBAN SHOPPER'S DIVERSITY. *International Conference on Community Development*. 1(1), pp. 578-588. Jakarta: ICCD. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.33068/iccd.Vol1.Iss1.87>
- Mulyaningrum, N. I., Lestari, N. S., & Wiastuti, R. D. (2018). Accessible Information in Tourism: Case of Casual Italian Restaurant. *National Conference of Creative Industry: Sustainable Tourism Industry for Economic Development* (pp. 230-240). Jakarta: Universitas Bunda Mulia.
- Pacific Asia Travel Association.* (2015). Retrieved from <https://sustain.pata.org/tourism-for-all/>
- Prescott, M. (2015, August 3). Accessible Tourism. *Transforming Communities Through Tourism*. Vancouver, Vancouver, Canada: Link BC.
- Richard, B., Kaak, K., & Orłowski, M. (2017, July 3). *Theme Park Tourism*. (L. L. Lowry, Ed.) New York: SAGE Publications, Inc. doi: <http://dx.doi.org/10.4135/9781483368924>
- Soewadji, J. (2012). *Pengantar Metodologi Penelitian*. Jakarta: Mitra Wacana Media.
- Sustainable Tourism.* (n.d.). Retrieved April 6, 2019, from [https://nmssanctuaries.blob.core.windows.net/sanctuaries-prod/media/archive/management/pdfs/sustain\\_tourism\\_mod10\\_curr.pdf](https://nmssanctuaries.blob.core.windows.net/sanctuaries-prod/media/archive/management/pdfs/sustain_tourism_mod10_curr.pdf)
- TMII Pesona Indonesia.* (2016). Retrieved from [http://www.tamanmini.com/pesona\\_indonesia/](http://www.tamanmini.com/pesona_indonesia/)
- Triastuti, E., & Rakhmani, I. (2011). Cyber Taman Mini Indonesia Indah: Ethnicity and Imagi-Nation in Blogging Culture. *Internetworking Indonesia Journal*, 3(2), pg.5-13.
- UNEP. (2005). *Making Tourism More Sustainable & WTO*. Paris: UNEP & UNWTO.
- UNHCR. (2017). *UNHCR - The UN - Refugee Agency*. Retrieved from <https://www.unhcr.org/people-with-disabilities.html>
- UNWTO. (2016). *Accessible Tourism for All: An Opportunity within Our Reach*. Madrid: World Tourism Organization.
- UNWTO. (2016). *Highlights of the 1st UNWTO Conference on Accessible Tourism in Europe*. San Marino: World Tourism Organization.
- V. Lambert & Lambert, C. (2012). Qualitative Descriptive Research: An Acceptable Design. *Pacific Rim International Journal of Nursing Research*, 16(4), 255.
- Wardijono, B., Wardhani, I., Chandra, Y., & Pamungkas, B. (2018). 3D Virtual Environment of Taman Mini Indonesia Indah in a Web. *4th International Seminar of Mathematics, Science and Computer Science Education*. 1013. Bandung: IOP Publishing. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1088/1742-6596/1013/1/012158>
- World Tourism Organization. (2013). *Recommendations on Accesible Tourism for all*. Madrid: UNWTO.
- World Tourism Organization. (2013). *Recommendations on Accesible tourism for all*. Madrid: UNWTO.
- World Tourism Organization. (2016). *World Tourism Day 2016 "Tourism for All - promoting universal accessibility" Good Practices in the AccessibleTourismSupply Chain*. Madrid: UNWTO.
- Zsarnoczky, M. (2017). Accessible tourism in the European Union. *Engines of Urban and Regional Development 6th Central European Conference in Regional Science* (pp. 30-39). Banska Bystrica: CERS.